

# Differential effects of tree species identity on rhizospheric bacterial and fungal community richness and composition across multiple trace element-contaminated sites

Stéphane Pfendler, Lisa Ciadamidaro, Shinji Ozaki, Aurélie Bonin, Pierre Taberlet, Cyril Zappelini, François Maillard, Damien Blaudez, Michel Chalot

## ▶ To cite this version:

Stéphane Pfendler, Lisa Ciadamidaro, Shinji Ozaki, Aurélie Bonin, Pierre Taberlet, et al.. Differential effects of tree species identity on rhizospheric bacterial and fungal community richness and composition across multiple trace element-contaminated sites. Science of the Total Environment, 2024, 912, pp.168600. 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2023.168600 . hal-04429741

## HAL Id: hal-04429741 https://hal.univ-lorraine.fr/hal-04429741v1

Submitted on 9 Jan 2025

**HAL** is a multi-disciplinary open access archive for the deposit and dissemination of scientific research documents, whether they are published or not. The documents may come from teaching and research institutions in France or abroad, or from public or private research centers. L'archive ouverte pluridisciplinaire **HAL**, est destinée au dépôt et à la diffusion de documents scientifiques de niveau recherche, publiés ou non, émanant des établissements d'enseignement et de recherche français ou étrangers, des laboratoires publics ou privés.



Distributed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License

Version of Record: https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0048969723072285 Manuscript\_5382a6788aa675d9b24295816da5f940

1	Differential effects of tree species identity on rhizospheric bacterial and fungal
2	community richness and composition across multiple trace element-contaminated sites
3	
4	
5	Stéphane Pfendler <sup>1</sup> , Lisa Ciadamidaro <sup>1</sup> , Shinji Ozaki <sup>1</sup> , Aurélie Bonin <sup>2</sup> , Pierre
6	Taberlet <sup>2, 3</sup> , Cyril Zappelini <sup>1</sup> , François Maillard <sup>1</sup> , Damien Blaudez <sup>4</sup> , Michel Chalot <sup>1, 5</sup>
7	
8	<sup>1</sup> Université de Franche-Comté, CNRS, Chrono-environnement, F-25200 Montbéliard, France
9	<sup>2</sup> Université Grenoble Alpes, CNRS, LECA, Laboratoire d'Ecologie Alpine, F-38000
10	Grenoble, France
11	<sup>3</sup> UiT – The Arctic University of Norway, Tromsø Museum, Tromsø, Norway
12	<sup>4</sup> Université de Lorraine, CNRS, LIEC, F-54000 Nancy, France
13	<sup>5</sup> Université de Lorraine, Faculté des Sciences et Technologies, F-54000 Nancy, France
14	
15	Current addresses
16	Shinji Ozaki: UK Centre for Ecology & Hydrology Lancaster Environment Centre, Library
17	Avenue, Bailrigg, Lancaster, LA1 4AP, United Kingdom
18	
19	François Maillard: Microbial Ecology Group, Department of Biology, Lund University, Lund,
20	Sweden
21	
22	Cyril Zappelini: Agroécologie, INRAE, Institut Agro, Université de Bourgogne, Univ.
23	Bourgogne Franche-Comté, F-21000 Dijon, France
24	
25	* Correspondence: stephane.pfendler@univ-fcomte.fr

#### 26 Abstract:

Soil microbial communities play a key role in plant nutrition and stress tolerance. This 27 is particularly true in sites contaminated by trace metals, which often have low fertility and 28 stressful conditions for woody plants in particular. However, we have limited knowledge of 29 the abiotic and biotic factors affecting the richness and composition of microbial communities 30 inhabiting the rhizosphere of plants in contaminated sites. Using high-throughput amplicon 31 sequencing, we studied the rhizospheric bacterial and fungal community structures of 14 32 woody plant families planted in three contrasting sites contaminated by metals (Pb, Cd, Zn, 33 Mn, Fe, S). The rhizospheric bacterial communities in the given sites showed no significant 34 difference between the various woody species but did differ significantly between sites. The 35 Proteobacteria phylum was dominant, accounting for over 25% of the overall relative 36 abundance, followed by Actinobacteria, Bacteroidetes and Gemmatimonadetes. Site was also 37 the main driver of fungal community composition, yet unlike bacteria, tree species identity 38 significantly affected fungal communities. The Betulaceae, Salicaceae and Fagaceae families 39 had a high proportion of Basidiomycota, particularly ectomycorrhizal fungi, and the lowest 40 diversity and richness. The other tree families and the unplanted soil harboured a greater 41 abundance of Ascomycota and Mucoromycota. Consequently, for both bacteria and fungi, the 42 site effect significantly impacted their community richness and composition, while the 43 influence of plants on the richness and composition of rhizospheric microbial communities 44 stayed consistent across sites and was dependent on the microbial kingdom. Finally, we 45 highlighted the importance of considering this contrasting response of plant rhizospheric 46 microbial communities in relation to their host identity, particularly to improve assisted 47 revegetation efforts at contaminated sites. 48

49

50 Keywords: Phytomanagement, Metabarcoding, Contaminated sites, Microbial communities

### 51 **1. Introduction**

In the last two centuries, soil pollution in European countries has increased, and the 52 number of polluted sites has reached approximately three million (Europe's environment -53 The fourth assessment). Among soil contaminants, mineral oil, trace elements (TEs) and 54 polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons are the most common (Mench et al., 2010; Quintela-55 Sabarís et al., 2017). In addition, soil contaminants may be transferred or dispersed to other 56 environmental compartments by several drivers, such as wind (Quintela-Sabarís et al., 2017). 57 Conventional engineering technologies for mitigating soil pollution have often been proven 58 economically prohibitive and ecologically unfriendly (Adriano et al., 2004). Consequently, it 59 is necessary to find new strategies to mitigate and remediate soil pollution (Hullot et al., 60 2021). New soil management strategies have emerged in recent decades, prominently 61 featuring plant-based alternatives such as phytoremediation (Kidd et al., 2015). This 62 development has led to significant growth in the literature about using native pioneer trees for 63 revegetation efforts on degraded lands (Asensio et al., 2018; Mleczek et al., 2017). 64 Importantly, most studies have focused on contaminated sites planted with a single tree 65 species (Beauchamp et al., 2018; Gonzalez et al., 2018) or various genotypes of the same 66 species, such as poplar (Di Baccio et al., 2003; Laureysens et al., 2004; Pottier et al., 2015; 67 Robinson et al., 2007; Sebastiani et al., 2004). In some other studies, a combination of trees 68 (Al Souki et al., 2022; Hullot et al., 2021) or trees and herbaceous plants (Desjardins et al., 69 2018) has been investigated, and in some of these studies, plant-associated microorganisms 70 were studied. Plant microbiomes are very diverse and contribute to plant fitness; thus, they 71 deserve attention because they might help plants deal with the often harsh conditions of 72 polluted sites. 73

Soil contamination, as well as plant-based management, induces changes in fungal and
 bacterial community structures. It was reported that TEs have several deleterious effects on

microorganisms and play a substantial role as an environmental filter in structuring soil 76 communities (Song et al., 2021). Several authors have used the phytoremediation strategy 77 combined with bacterial or fungal inoculation (Ciadamidaro et al., 2019; Phanthavongsa et al., 78 2017; Pogrzeba et al., 2017) to enhance plant resistance to soil contamination and improve 79 biomass production. Among the mechanisms involved, microorganisms can enhance plant 80 growth and health by producing phytohormones, cytokinins and gibberellins (Taghavi et al., 81 2009; Tanimoto, 2005). They can also improve nutrient availability through the production of 82 organic acids and siderophores (Álvarez-López et al., 2020). Furthermore, a large range of 83 woody species are known to select their microbial communities (Zhang et al., 2021) to 84 improve plant resistance to stress (e.g., through production of 1-aminocyclopropane-1-85 carboxylic acid deaminase), such as drought, insects, diseases, or TEs (Glick, 2014; Meyer et 86 al., 2023, 2023; Taghavi et al., 2009) 87

Numerous authors have assessed the microbial communities in noncontaminated 88 rhizospheric soils, such as forestry fields (Baldrian, 2016; de Gannes et al., 2016). Most of 89 these studies focused on woody species of biomass interest or noble woods (e.g., oaks, 90 poplars, pines). At contaminated sites, the majority of studies have assessed the rhizospheric 91 fungal (Foulon et al., 2016; Gonzalez et al., 2018) and bacterial communities (Álvarez-López 92 et al., 2020; Durand et al., 2018; Girardot et al., 2020; Zappelini et al., 2018) in monoculture 93 and/or in several species from the same genus/genotype (e.g., Populus, Salix, Betula). 94 However, as contaminants (e.g., TEs) are known to impact microbial communities, it is 95 important to understand the structure of rhizospheric fungi and bacteria. Moreover, the 96 microbial communities from trees growing in several types of soil exhibiting different 97 agronomical and contamination parameters have been poorly studied. 98

In Leforest, Carrières and Thann, three studied contaminated sites in France, the
 growth of cultured woody species does not appear to be restricted by the presence of TEs in

the soil (Ciadamidaro et al., 2019). However, at the three sites, the effect of these trace 101 elements on the rhizospheric microbial communities that likely drive plant primary 102 productivity is unknown. It is thus important to determine how site and tree species identity 103 shape the richness and composition of the rhizospheric microbial communities, as it may help 104 in understanding the revegetation processes of contaminated areas. With regard to our 105 previous data (Foulon et al., 2016), we hypothesized that the site characteristics would 106 intensely shape bacterial and fungal communities. In a second hypothesis, we predicted that 107 tree species would be an additional source of variation in microbial communities. We also 108 aimed to determine which of the two factors (soil parameters vs. tree species identity) is the 109 main microbial community driver. To address these hypotheses, the rhizospheric bacterial and 110 fungal communities of twenty-five woody species growing at three phytomanaged sites with 111 contaminants of various origins were assessed and compared using high-throughput amplicon 112 sequencing. In this study, we also address the question of the influence of site 113 physicochemical parameters versus tree selection on microbial communities. 114

115

### 116 **2. Materials and Methods**

117 2.1. Site description

We conducted our study at three experimental sites in France, namely, Carrières 118 (48°57'39.7"N 2°02'09.6"E), Leforest ((50°25'40.5"N 3°02'40.5"E) and Thann (47°47'48.4"N 119 7°08'20.8"E) (Ciadamidaro et al., 2019). Carrières and Leforest have agricultural soils with 120 high levels of lead (Pb), cadmium (Cd) and zinc (Zn) due to wastewater and atmospheric 121 deposition, respectively. Thann is an industrial landfill mainly contaminated by manganese 122 (Mn), sulfur (S) and iron (Fe). They were initially planted in autumn 2013 with 38 tree 123 varieties belonging to 14 families (Sapindaceae, Betulaceae, Bignoniaceae, Meliaceae, 124 Elaeagnaceae, Paulowniaceae, Platanaceae, Juglandaceae, Moraceae, Fagaceae, 125

Anacardiaceae, Salicaceae, Oleaceae, Ulmaceae). Each of the three sites was divided into four 126 plots that were planted with 16 (in Carrières and Leforest) or 18 (in Thann) tree species (31 127 replicates per tree species in each plot). For the present study, 12 tree species were selected 128 per site based on their initial growth (Table S1). Pterocarya stenoptera (PTS, Fagaceae), Salix 129 aquatica grandis (SAQ, Salicaeae) and Ostrya capinifolia (OCA, Betulaceae) were the 130 common species at all three sites. The species that were planted on one or two sites are ABU 131 (Acer buergerianum), ALS (Alnus subcordata), ASA (Acer saccharinum), CON (Control -132 unplanted soil), CSP (Catalpa speciosa), EUM (Eleagnus umbellata), FOR (Fraxinus ornus), 133 FOX (Fraxinus oxyphylla), HRH (Hippophae rhamnoides), MPO (Maclura pomifera), OCA 134 (Ostrya carpinifolia), PLO (Platanus orientalis), POX (Populus maximowiczii x P. 135 berolinensis (Oxford clone)), PTS (Pterocarya stenoptera), QAC (Quercus acutissima), QCE 136 (Quercus cerris), QPD (Quercus pedonculata), QPT (Quercus petraea), RCO (Rhus 137 copallina), SAC (Salix acutifolia), SAL (Salix alba), SAQ (Salix aquatica grandis), SCA 138 (Salix caprea), SFR (Salix fragilis), UPA (Ulmus pumila) and ZSE (Zelkova serrata). The 139 initial sampling campaign (Ciadamidaro et al., 2019) was carried out in 2015, i.e., two 140 growing seasons after plantation establishment. For the present study, the sampling campaign 141 was carried out in early spring 2018, *i.e.*, four growing seasons after planting. 142

143

## 144 2.2. Soil parameters and sampling

For each of the four plots at each site, we randomly selected three trees per species (*i.e.*, 12 replicates/tree species/site) that were uprooted using a mechanical shovel. Directly after uprooting, approximately 2 L of non-rhizospheric soil (i.e. unplanted soil corresponding to the control soil = CON) and rhizospheric soils were collected in sterile plastic bags and kept at 4 °C for further soil analysis of CaCl<sub>2</sub>-extractable concentrations of 12 TEs. For community analysis, 16 g of the rhizospheric soil of each tree was sampled as described and placed in 250 mL plastic tubes with four silica gel bags as described in Taberlet et al. (2012).
In total, 432 rhizospheric soil samples were collected (3 sites x 4 plots/site x 12 species x 3
replicates) and shipped to the Laboratoire d'Écologie Alpine (Grenoble, France) for DNA
extraction, PCR amplification and high-throughput amplicon sequencing.

The soil physico-chemical characteristics were analysed in 2013 at the plantation 155 (agronomical characteristics and TE concentrations), and in 2017 at the sampling campaign 156 (TE concentrations). The initial physico-chemical characteristics of the soils were presented 157 in a previous study (Ciadamidaro et al., 2019). The soil samples were dried at 40 °C in a 158 forced air oven to a constant weight and ground with a grinder (agate mortar, Retsch RM100). 159 The samples were sent to a certified laboratory (SADEF, France) for the following analyses: 160 particle size distribution, exchangeable Ca (CaO), Mg (MgO), K (K2O) and Na (Na2O), 161 cation exchange capacity (CEC) (NF X 31-130), organic matter (OM) (NF ISO 14235), total 162 CaCO3 (NF ISO 10693), total nitrogen (Nt) (NF ISO 13878), total phosphorus (Joret-Hebert 163 method) (NF X 31-161) and soluble boron (B) (NF X 31-122). The available element 164 concentrations in the soil were assessed in 2013 and 2017 using a 0.01 M CaCl2-extraction 165 with a sample extraction ratio of 1:10 via ICP-AES. Briefly, in 2013, the soil pH ranged from 166 5.4 at Leforest to 7.1 at Thann, with Carrières presenting an intermediate pH (pH= 6.8). Other 167 parameters, such as the organic matter (37, 68 and 29 g kg<sup>-1</sup> dry weight (DW) in Leforest, 168Carrières and Thann, respectively), total nitrogen (1.9, 3.8 and 1.3 g kg<sup>-1</sup> DW) and organic 169 carbon (21, 39 and 16 g kg<sup>-1</sup> DW) concentrations, were higher in Carrières than in the two 170 other sites. The main chemical elements characterizing the soil of Thann were Mn (total Mn 171 concentrations [Mn] tot = 1472  $\mu$ g g<sup>-1</sup>), Fe ([Fe] tot = 28267  $\mu$ g g<sup>-1</sup>) and S ([S] tot = 85712  $\mu$ g 172  $g^{-1}$ ), while Pb ([Pb] tot = 311 and 195 µg  $g^{-1}$ ), Zn ([Zn] tot = 685 and 250 µg  $g^{-1}$ ) and Cd ([Cd] 173 tot = 6 and 3.7 µg g<sup>-1</sup>) were the main metallic contaminants in Carrières and Leforest at the 174time of planting. 175

176

## 177 2.3. DNA extraction

Extracellular DNA was extracted from the dried soil following a modified version of 178 the phosphate buffer protocol described by Taberlet et al. (2012). Briefly, each soil sample 179 was combined with 20 ml of saturated phosphate buffer (Na<sub>2</sub>HPO<sub>4</sub>; 0.12 M; pH 8). The 180 resulting mixture was shaken gently (45 rpm) for 15 min and centrifuged at 11,000 g for 10 181 min. The following DNA extraction steps were carried out using the NucleoSpin Soil Kit 182 (Macherey-Nagel, Düren, Germany) according to the manufacturer's instructions and after 183 skipping the lysis steps. Four hundred microlitres of supernatant was added to 250 µL of SB 184 buffer, loaded onto the extraction column, and washed once with SB buffer, once with SW1 185 buffer, and twice with SW2 buffer. The final elution was performed with 100 µL of SE buffer. 186

187

#### 188 2.4. Molecular methods and sequencing

Microbial diversity was surveyed using the Bact02 (GCCAGCMGCCGCGGTAA and 189 GGACTACCMGGGTATCTAA) and Fung02 (GGAAGTAAAAGTCGTAACAAGG and 190 CAAGAGATCCGTTGYTGAAAGTK) primer pair reported in Taberlet et al. (2018). These 191 markers target the V4 region of the bacterial 16S rDNA and the fungal ITS1 region, 192 respectively. Four independent PCR replicates were carried out for each DNA extract and 193 each marker. To allow bioinformatic discrimination of PCR replicates after sequencing, eight-194 nucleotide tags were added to the 5' end of both the forwards and reverse primers so that each 195 PCR replicate was represented by a unique combination of forwards and reverse tags. Tags 196 had at least five nucleotide differences among them (Coissac, 2012). Two to four random 197 nucleotides were also added on the 5' end of the tags to ensure sufficient sequence diversity 198 and efficient detection of clusters during sequencing. 199

PCR amplifications were performed in a 20  $\mu$ L volume containing 10  $\mu$ L of AmpliTaq Gold 360 Master Mix (Applied Biosystems, Foster City, CA, USA), each primer at 0.2  $\mu$ M, 0.16  $\mu$ L of 20 mg.ml<sup>-1</sup> bovine serum albumin (BSA; Roche Diagnostics, Basel, Switzerland), and 2  $\mu$ L of DNA extract. Thermocycling conditions included an initial DNA polymerase activation step of 10 min at 95 °C, 40 cycles with a 30 s denaturation at 95 °C, a 30 s annealing step at 53 °C for Bact02 and 56 °C for Fung02, and a 60 s elongation step at 72 °C, followed by a final extension at 72 °C for 7 min.

After amplification, PCR products were combined in equal volumes and purified with the MinElute PCR purification kit (Qiagen, Hilden, Germany) following the manufacturer's instructions. Library preparation and sequencing were outsourced to Fasteris SA (Geneva, Switzerland). Four sequencing libraries (two per marker) were prepared according to the PCR-free MetaFast protocol (www.fasteris.com) that limits the formation of chimaeras. All amplicons were sequenced on a HiSeq 2500 sequencing platform (Illumina, San Diego, CA, USA) using the rapid run mode generating 250 bp paired-end sequences.

To monitor potential contaminants and false positives caused by tag jumps (Schnell et al. 2015), the experiment included extraction and PCR negatives, as well as unused tag combinations. Soil extracts from another experiment were also used as positive controls.

217

## 218 2.5. Bioinformatic analysis of metabarcoding data

In total, 81,589,286 sequencing clusters were paired-end sequenced. Raw reads were analysed using the OBITools software suite (Boyer et al., 2016), specifically dedicated to handling metabarcoding data. Paired-end reads were first assembled with the program *illuminapairedend*, keeping only sequences with an alignment score higher than 40. Aligned sequences were assigned to the corresponding sample using the program *ngsfilter* by allowing two and zero mismatches for primers and tags, respectively. After sequence dereplication

using obiuniq, poor-quality sequences (i.e., containing "N"), sequences whose length fell 225 outside the expected size interval (shorter than 40 bp for Bact02 or 66 bp for Fung02) and 226 sequences observed less than ten times in at least one PCR replicate were filtered out. The 227 remaining unique sequences were clustered into molecular operational taxonomic units 228 (MOTUs) as follows. First, the Sumatra algorithm (Mercier et al., 2013) was run to compute 229 pairwise similarities between sequences based on the length of the longest common 230 subsequence (LCS). Then, pairwise similarities were used to cluster the sequences with a 231 similarity threshold of 97% using Sumaclust (Mercier et al., 2013). Abundances of sequences 232 belonging to the same cluster (i.e., MOTU) were summed, and the cluster centre was kept as 233 the MOTU representative of the cluster. The final datasets contained 2,440 MOTUs and 234 7,130,286 sequences for Bact02 and 8,119 MOTUs and 25,772,129 sequences for Fung02. 235 Finally, the taxonomic assignment of each MOTU was performed using the program *ecotag* 236 of OBITools, which compares the MOTU sequence to a database of full-length reference 237 metabarcodes. The reference database was built for each marker by running the ecoPCR 238 program (Ficetola et al., 2010). More specifically, ecoPCR in-silico PCR was carried out on 239 the EMBL public database (release 133) with the primer pair used for the experiment and 240allowing three mismatches per primer. The obtained reference databases were further curated 241 by keeping only sequences assigned at the species, genus and family levels. 242

243

## 244 2.7. Statistical analysis of metabarcoding data

The community composition of all three sites was first analysed separately for bacterial and fungal OTUs. A Bray–Curtis dissimilarity matrix was built for both fungal and bacterial community compositions and graphically represented by principal coordinate analysis (PCoA) (Borcard et al., 2018). Significant differences in community composition were assessed by permutational multivariate analysis of variance (PERMANOVA) between the three sites (Anderson, 2001). The numbers of OTUs observed in more than one site ("shared OTUs") and those in only one site ("specific OTUs") were represented by Venn diagrams. The same approach (PCoA followed by PERMANOVA and Venn diagram construction) was used for the OTUs observed in the rhizosphere of the three common woody species (PTS, SAQ and OCA).

Richness, abundance and community composition were then separately analysed per 255 site for both bacterial and fungal OTUs. Richness was estimated by the number of different 256 OTUs, whereas abundance was estimated by the number of OTUs per unique OTU or per 257 phylum. Richness was compared between planted woody species per site using the 258 nonparametric Kruskal-Wallis test. When the Kruskal-Wallis test showed a significant 259 difference, multiple comparisons by Fisher's least significant difference with the Bonferroni 260 correction were also carried out. The numbers of shared and specific OTUs between planted 261 woody species were visualized by a graphic composed of a matrix encoding all set 262 intersections and bar plots representing the number of OTUs in each intersection (Lex and 263 Gehlenborg, 2014). Abundance was estimated by the number of OTUs in different phyla. 264 Compositions at the phylum level were graphically represented by PCoA and tested by 265 PERMANOVA. 266

Redundancy analysis (RDA) was carried out per site to assess the effects of the 267 environmental conditions on the microbial communities (Borcard et al., 2018). Fungal OTU 268 composition was considered the response matrix. A Hellinger transformation was applied to 269 each of the bacterial and fungal community compositions before carrying out RDA. CaCl<sub>2</sub>-270 extractable concentrations of 10 TEs (Al, Cd, Fe, K, Mg, Mn, P, Pb, S, Zn) were 271 logarithmically transformed and applied to RDA as explanatory variables. Significant 272 explanatory variables were determined by forward selection (Borcard et al., 2018). Each of all 273 variables was added to the null model and tested its significance by permutation. When there 274

were several significant variables, the most significant one was added. Then, another selection was carried out to check the significance of the remaining variables. This process was repeated until there was no significant variable. The proportion of variance explained by the selected explanatory variables was indicated by an adjusted  $R^2$  (Borcard et al., 2018).

All statistical analyses were performed using R software (version 4.1.0; R 279 Development Core Team). The Kruskal-Wallis tests and multiple comparisons were 280 performed by the "kruskal" function in the "agricolae" package. Set intersections were 281 visualized by the "upset" function in the "UpSetR" package. PERMANOVA and tests for 282 multivariate homogeneity were carried out by the "adonis" and the "betadisper" functions in 283 the "vegan" package, respectively. The "ordiplot" and "ordiellipse" functions in the "vegan" 284 package were used to carry out PCoA and draw confidence ellipses, respectively. RDA and 285 forward selection were carried out by the "rda" and "ordistep" functions in the "vegan" 286 package. 287

288

#### 289 3. Results and discussion

3.1. Site is the main factor affecting the composition of rhizospheric bacterial and fungal
communities

The soil properties of the three study sites (Carrières, Leforest and Thann) were significantly different at the planting time (Fig. 1), as shown in Ciadamidaro et al. (2019). Here, we further analysed the TE bioavailable fractions, as well as pH (Table S2). In general, the extractable TE concentrations in rhizospheric soils were lower than the total TE concentrations. Additionally, the bioavailable TE concentrations were slightly higher than the extractable TE concentrations in the bulk soil measured in a previous experiment conducted at the same sites in 2015 (Ciadamidaro et al. 2019).



299

**Figure 1.** Soil parameters and microbial features of the three sites. (a) Principal component analysis (PCA) of agronomic parameters measured at the Carrières, Leforest and Thann sites at the plantation (in 2013). All parameters were standardized before PCA because of their different units. Principal coordinate analysis (PCoA) of the bacterial (b) and fungal (c) communities from rhizospheric and non-rhizospheric soils sampled at the three sites, Leforest (LEF), Carrières (CAR) and Thann (THA) in 2017. The numbers of specific and shared

bacterial and fungal OTUs are shown in Venn diagrams. Abbreviations: CEC (cation
exchange capacity); OM organic matter); Tot (total); Ass\_phos (assimilable phosphorus).
Squares: bulk soils; circles: rhizospheric soils.

309

At the three study sites, the CaCl<sub>2</sub> extractable concentrations of Cd, Pb, Zn and Mn in 310 the rhizospheric soils were compared between the 12 tree species and the control soil. No 311 significant difference was observed for Cd, Pb and Mn, while Zn showed few differences. 312 Significantly higher concentrations of Zn were measured for the three Quercus species at 313 Carrières, but the control soil showed a significantly lower Zn concentration (p value < 0.05) 314 in comparison to all the rhizospheric soils. In general, the pH values at the three sites slightly 315 decreased from those measured in our previous experiment in 2015: from 5.4 to 5.0 at 316 Leforest and from 6.8 and 7.1 to 6.7 at Carrières and Thann, respectively. Given the ability of 317 certain woody species to accumulate TE in their aerial tissues, changes in total TE 318 concentrations may have occurred between 2013 and 2017, but these were not measured, 319 given the large number of samples. A new sampling campaign is planned for 2024, which will 320 provide a more detailed answer to this very pertinent question. 321

The bacterial (p value < 0.01, Fig. 1b) and fungal (p value < 0.01, Fig. 1c) 322 communities significantly differed between the three study sites. For bacterial communities, 323 the Venn diagram shows that the Leforest and Carrières communities shared more OTUs with 324 each other than with the Thann community, which had more specific OTUs (563 specific 325 OTUs compared with 41 and 107 OTUs at Carrières and Leforest, respectively). For fungal 326 communities, twice as many specific OTUs (1508, 1531 and 1993 OTUs in Carrières, 327 Leforest and Thann, respectively) were found at each site compared with their shared OTUs 328 (714 OTUs). 329

The differences in soil structure and physico-chemical composition may explain the 330 difference in microbial community composition. Several studies have reported that soil 331 chemistry strongly influences microbial communities (Van Horn et al., 2013; Urbanová et al., 332 2015; Pinot, 2016; Xue et al., 2018). For instance, Dequiedt et al. (2009) showed a highly 333 significant correlation between microbial communities and soil physico-chemical parameters 334 such as soil texture, pH, CEC, Corg, N, CaCO<sub>3</sub>, P, Ca, Mg and K. It is also known that one of 335 the most prominent factors affecting the microbial community in the soil is pH (Foulon et al., 336 2016; Rousk et al., 2009), which controls numerous biotic factors, such as soil bacterial 337 biomass and composition (Fierer and Jackson, 2006a). However, pH seemed to be less 338 important for soil fungi (Lauber et al., 2009; Rousk et al., 2009; Urbanová et al., 2015). The 339 impact of tree species is further discussed in Section 3.2 below. 340

Figure 2 represents the number of fungal (Fig. 2 a, b and c) and bacterial (Fig. 2 d, e 341 and f) OTUs that were specific to one soil sample (red bars) or shared (green bars) by all soil 342 samples at the three sites. At the Leforest site, 48% of the total fungal OTUs (1399/2910) 343 recorded were specific to one soil sample, *i.e.*, to one tree species (Fig. 2a), whereas 52% 344 (1511/2910) of the OTUs were shared by at least two tree species (not shown). In detail, Salix 345 fragilis (SFR) had the fewest specific OTUs (39/2910 = 1.3%), while Platanus orientalis 346 (PLO) presented the most specific OTUs (7.4%). The number of fungal OTUs shared by all 347 the tree species accounted for 5.4% (156/2910), whereas the control soil (unplanted soil) 348 presented 7.9% of the total OTUs in the whole Leforest soil (229/2910). Similarly, at the 349 Carrières site, 46.4% of the total fungal OTUs (1465/3158) were specific to a single tree 350 species sample (Fig. 2b), whereas 53.6% (1693/3158) of the OTUs were shared by at least 351 two tree species (not shown). The Quercus, Ostrya, Salix and Poplar species showed the 352 fewest specific OTUs. A total of 4.8% of the total OTUs (152/3158) were shared by all tree 353 species. Finally, 38% of the total fungal OTUs (1471/3872) recorded at the Thann site were 354

specific to one soil sample (Fig. 2c), whereas 62% (2401/3872) of the OTUs were shared by at least two tree species (not shown). As at the Leforest and Carrières sites, the same tree species (*Salix, Ostrya, Quercus*) accounted for the fewest specific OTUs, whereas 5.4% of OTUs were shared by all the tree species. These results are in agreement with those of Buée et al. (2011), who demonstrated that more than one-third of the dominant fungal species were restricted to one or two tree species.

For the bacterial communities, 33% of the OTUs were shared by all tree species at the 361 Leforest site, whereas 12.2% of bacterial OTUs were specific, with a maximum of 1.6% for 362 Pterocarya stenoptera (PTS) and a minimum of 0.3% for Salix caprea (SCA), Ostrya 363 carpinifolia (OCA) and Quercus cerris (QCE; Fig. 2d). The same trends were observed at the 364 Carrières site (maximum 2.5% for Populus "Oxford" (POX) and minimum 0.5% for Acer 365 saccharinum (ASA), Fig. 2e) and the Thann site (maximum 2.1% for Salix alba (SAL) and 366 minimum 0.2% for OCA and PLO, Fig. 2f). The results obtained for bacterial communities 367 show a different pattern in comparison to those of the fungal communities, especially because 368 of the high number of bacterial OTUs that are shared by all the tree species and the low 369 number of specific OTUs. 370

371

372

373



Figure 2. Shared and specific fungal (a, b and c) and bacterial (d, e and f) OTUs recorded 375 from the rhizosphere of different tree species at the Leforest (a and d), Carrières (b and e) 376 and Thann (c and f) sites. The horizontal blue bars correspond to the number of OTUs 377 recorded for each tree species. The green bars indicate the number of OTUs common to all 378 tree species designated with green dots (e.g., in Fig. 2 (a) there are 156 OTUs that are shared 379 by all the tree species). The red bars represent the number of OTUs specific to a tree species 380 designated by the red dots (e.g., in Fig. 2 (a) there are 215 OTUs specific to the PLO 381 rhizospheric soil). The OTUs shared by more than 2 sampled trees (and less than 12) are not 382 shown for clarity. 383

384

385

#### 3.2. Tree species and soil characteristics have different impacts on bacterial and

386 *fungal communities* 

At each of the three sites, the Proteobacteria phylum was dominant, accounting for 387 more than 25% of the total abundance (Fig. 3). The Bacteroidetes and Chloroflexi phyla 388 further dominated at the Leforest site (Fig. 3a), whereas Actinobacteria dominated at the 389 Carrières (Fig. 3b) and Thann (Fig. 3c) sites. The obtained results allow us to extend our 390 knowledge for several tree species that have not yet been reported. For tree species that have 391 already been studied (e.g., Populus, Salix), the present results are in agreement with those 392 obtained in several other studies. Fierer (2017) reported that Bacteroidetes, Proteobacteria, 393 and Actinobacteria are usually dominant in soils. Álvarez-López et al. (2020) found a 394 predominance of Actinobacteria and Proteobacteria in the Betula pendula rhizosphere at the 395 Thann site. These two phyla also dominated under poplar trees at the Pierrelaye site (Ile-de-396 France, France), of which the contamination features were similar to those of the Carrières 397 site (Foulon et al., 2016). The Proteobacteria and Actinobacteria phyla were also predominant 398 in ultramafic rhizosphere soils (Lopez et al., 2022), in an Indian Mn-contaminated mine 399

tailing (Ghosh and Das, 2018) and in a Cu-polluted mining soil in China (Jia et al., 2022). 400 Actinobacteria exhibit diverse physiological and metabolic features, such as the production of 401 extracellular enzymes and the formation of a wide variety of secondary metabolites, which 402 makes them relevant microbial resources for bioremediation (Narsing Rao et al., 2022). 403 Proteobacteria isolated from a highly polluted coal mine drainage showed capacities for toxic 404 metal sequestration that render them useful for bioremediation (Oyetibo et al., 2021). 405 Additionally, the PCoA of the composition of the bacterial communities highlights significant 406 differences between communities inhabiting the rhizospheric soil of planted trees compared to 407 unplanted controls at the Leforest (Fig. 3d), Carrières (Fig. 3e) and Thann (Fig. 3f) sites. Tree 408 species greatly affect the composition, diversity and activity of soil bacterial communities 409 (Dukunde et al., 2019; Pfeiffer et al., 2013). However, bacterial richness did not differ 410 between planted and unplanted soils in the present study (Table 1). 411

Regarding the richness (Table 1) and abundance (data not shown) of bacterial OTUs, 412 our analyses revealed no significant difference between the different tree species, regardless 413 of the site. Similar trends were observed for the bacterial communities of various poplar 414 cultivars grown on contaminated soils, with little variation in bacterial richness and 415 abundance (Foulon et al., 2016). No difference in richness was found between the planted and 416 unplanted soils at our sites. Foulon et al. (2016) also found that bacterial species richness and 417 diversity in soil habitats were not different between planted and unplanted plots in a poplar 418 plantation in Pierrelaye (France). The lack of a significant relationship between plant diversity 419 and soil bacterial diversity was observed by (Fierer and Jackson, 2006b) in a field study. 420 Previous studies on grassland and agricultural sites (Buckley and Schmidt, 2001; Felske et al., 421 2000; Kowalchuk et al., 2002) also yielded similar conclusions. Different tree species (Acer 422 pseudoplatanus, Fagus sylvatica, Fraxinus excelsior, Carpinus betulus, Picea abies and Tilia 423 cordata) also hosted similar bacterial communities (Pfeiffer et al., 2013; Uroz et al., 2016). 424



**Figure 3.** Composition of the bacterial communities at the Leforest (a), Carrières (b) and Thann (c) sites at the phylum level based on 16S rRNA gene sequencing. Bacterial communities were further analysed using PCoA at Leforest (d), Carrières (e) and Thann (f).

429

Table 1. Bacterial and fungal richness at the three sites Leforest, Carrières and Thann for all
25 planted woody species (n=12). Significant differences are indicated in brackets. "CON"
corresponds to the control (unplanted plot).

	Carrières			Leforest			Thann	
	Bacteria	Fungi		Bacteria	Fungi		Bacteria	Fungi
	926 DTUs	3158 OTUs		984 OTUs	2910 OTUs		1657 OTUs	3872 OTUs
CO N	235 (n.s)	226 (a)	CON	239 (n.s)	241 (a)	CON	267 (n.s)	287 (a)

ASA	251 (n.s)	239 (a)	PLO	225 (n.s)	191 (ab)	ABU	297 (n.s)	302 (a)
EU M	245 (n.s)	227 (a)	PTS	241 (n.s)	188 (b)	MPO	271 (n.s)	292 (a)
FO X	247 (n.s)	229 (a)	OCA	217 (n.s)	165 (bc)	PLO	292 (n.s)	322 (a)
HR H	262 (n.s)	243 (a)	SAC	220 (n.s)	165 (bcd)	PTS	278 (n.s)	269 (a)
FO R	250 (n.s)	223 (ab)	SCA	234 (n.s)	162 (bcde)	UPA	284 (n.s)	284 (a)
PTS	252 (n.s)	185 (bc)	SAL	236 (n.s)	155 (cdef)	ZSE	272 (n.s)	297 (a)
SAQ	246 (n.s)	166 (cd)	SAQ	244 (n.s)	142 (cdefg)	RCO	280 (n.s)	317 (a)
OC A	258 (n.s)	135 (de)	SFR	236 (n.s)	143 (cdefg)	CSP	285 (n.s)	274 (a)
PO X	256 (n.s)	147 (de)	QPD	235 (n.s)	136 (defg)	OCA	287 (n.s)	170 (b)
QPT	244 (n.s)	152 (de)	POX	232 (n.s)	135 (efg)	QAC	263 (n.s)	144 (b)
QC E	248 (n.s)	126 (e)	QCE	231 (n.s)	128 (fg)	SAL	273 (n.s)	130 (b)
QP D	249 (n.s)	120 (e)	ASL	229 (n.s)	117 (g)	SAQ	263 (n.s)	196 (b)

433

In contrast to bacterial communities, fungal communities showed contrasting patterns among sites and tree species. Ascomycota, Basidiomycota and Mucoromycota sequences dominated at the Leforest (Fig. 4a), Carrières (Fig. 4b) and Thann (Fig. 4c) sites. The

proportion of Basidiomycota sequences ( $\geq$  50%) was significantly higher in tree species of the 437 Fagaceae, Salicaceae and Betulaceae (referred to as 'tree species Group 1'), together with 438 lower proportions of Ascomycota (< 35%) and Mucoromycota (< 15%) sequences, than in 439 tree species from the Sapindaceae, Bignoniaceae, Meliaceae, Moraceae, Elaeagnaceae, 440 Paulowniaceae, Platanaceae, Juglandaceae, Anacardiaceae, Oleaceae, and Ulmaceae families 441 (referred to as 'tree species Group 2'). Soils collected under the latter group of tree species, as 442 well as the control soils, showed higher proportions of Ascomycota ( $\geq$  50%) and 443 Mucoromycota (> 20%), contrasting with a much lower abundance of Basidiomycota 444sequences (<20%), than those collected under Group 1. Mucoromycota sequences from the 445 Thann site even reached 45% of the sequenced dataset for some tree species of these Group 2 446 families (e.g., UPA). Regarding the fungal richness index (Table 1), the woody species could 447 also be clustered into the two groups described above. Group 1 exhibited the lowest fungal 448 richness, while the highest fungal richness occurred in Group 2. The low fungal richness 449 observed for Group 1 may be explained by the tree species-specific nature of ectomycorrhizal 450 fungi (ECMFs), to which the majority of Basidiomycota fungi belong. In fact, Urbanová et al. 451 (2015) reported the complex nature of plant-fungal symbiosis of ECMFs, which explained 452 the stronger effects of trees on the fungal community than on the bacterial community. 453



**Figure 4.** Composition of the fungal communities at the Leforest (a), Carrières (b) and Thann (c) sites at the phylum level based on ITS rRNA gene sequencing. Fungal communities were further analysed using PCoA at Leforest (d), Carrières (e) and Thann (f).

458

The PCoA revealed that tree species might be classified into the two groups described 459 above based on their fungal communities. For instance, at the Leforest site, the Betulaceae 460and Salicaceae families (Group 1) did not show significantly different fungal communities, 461 which were similar to the communities under the Fagaceae family (Group 1) (Fig. 4d). The 462 unplanted soil, PTS and PLO species (Group 2) exhibited similar communities. Finally, 463 specific fungal communities for the ALS species were recorded at the Leforest site. Clear 464clusters of tree species (Group 1 versus Group 2) were also noticed for the Carrières (Fig. 4e) 465 and Thann (Fig. 4f) sites. In agreement with the present results, Lindhe et al. (2004) showed 466 that the highest similarities for fungal communities were found between a Betula sp. and a 467Populus sp., followed by a Quercus sp., compared to spruce. It has been hypothesized that the 468

richness and diversity of natural fungal communities are affected by tree species (*Buée et al.*,
2011; *Tedersoo et al.*, 2015).

- 471
- 472

## 3.3. Trees from the two tree species groups host distinct fungal communities

The previous datasets described above highlighted the occurrence of two tree family 473 groups, namely, Group 1 (Basidiomycota-enriched samples from the Fagaceae, the Salicaceae 474 and the Betulaceae) and Group 2 (Ascomycota-enriched samples from all the other tree 475 families). The ecological functions of the fungal species in these two groups were further 476 assessed using FunGuild (Nguyen et al., 2016), and the abundance of DNA reads was 477 calculated and expressed as a percentage of the total reads. Our analysis indicated that 74.9%, 47872.9% and 49.2% of the specific fungal reads of Group 1 tree families were assigned to the 479 ECMF guild for the Leforest, Carrières and Thann samples, respectively (Fig. 5, Fig. S1 and 480 Fig. S2). In a previous study at a set of post-mining sites recultivated with six different trees, 481 80% of the fungal sequences were composed of only 23 to 28 OTUs, which led to the 482 conclusion that the fungal taxa showed a greater tendency to be tree-specific (Urbanová et al., 483 2015). It can be hypothesized that tree species with few specific OTUs are selecting their 484symbionts in a more restrictive way and thus exhibit lower microbial richness. 485



Figure 5. Distribution of shared and specific OTUs for the two groups of trees, as well as the main fungal guilds on the Leforest site. The common OTUs, the specific OTUs (Group 1) and the specific OTUs (Group 2) represented 1,116 OTUs (38.4 %), 1,161 OTUs (39.9 %) and 631 OTUs (21.7 %), respectively.

491

The dominant ECMFs associated with Group 1 tree species in the present work 492 (Tuber, Tomentella, Hymenogaster, Geopora, and Hebeloma) were also identified in Salix 493 roots in a previous study carried out at a TE- and PCB-contaminated site (Fortin Faubert et 494 al., 2022) and in some Quercus species in other studies in tropical forests and in the Taihang 495 Mountains (China) (Morris et al., 2009; Wei et al., 2021). Members of the Hebeloma 496 mycorrhizal genus (e.g., H. mesophaeum) were frequently detected within forest soils, and 497 their presence was correlated with a high growth rate of host trees in soils contaminated with 498 metals (Durand et al., 2017; Foulon et al., 2016). Moreover, a peculiar trend was noticed for 499

Alnus subcordata planted at the Leforest site, of which 76% of dominant OTUs belonged to
 the *Tomentella* and *Alnicola* genera. *Alnus* species are known to contract specific symbiotic
 relationships with a few fungal genera (Schwob et al., 2017).

In contrast, only 0.32%, 0.21% and 4.8% of reads of Group 2 tree families were related to the ECMF guild at Leforest, Carrières and Thann, respectively, while saprotrophs and unidentified OTUs were dominant at these sites. The OTUs shared between the two groups that were identified in Leforest, Carrières and Thann samples were distributed within various fungal guilds (*e.g.*, orchid mycorrhizal, plant pathogen, wood saprotroph, ectomycorrhizal, fungal parasite, soil saprotroph, undefined saprotroph). However, none of these guilds were dominant in terms of read abundance.

510

511

### 3.4. Effect of environmental conditions on the microbial communities

At the Leforest site, no TE significantly explained fungal community composition. 512 However, the first two principal axes of the RDA represented 11.0 % and 6.5% of the fungal 513 community variation, respectively (Fig. S3a). A group of fungi associated with Group 1 tree 514 species (SAC, SAL, SAQ, SCA, SFR, QCE, QPD, OCA), mainly composed of Hymenogaster 515 griseus and H. vulgaris (ectomycorrhiza), was positively correlated with soil Zn, Cd, Pb, Fe 516 and Al, and to a lesser extent, with Mn and K. Moreover, three OTUs belonging to the 517 Tomentella and Alnicola genera, which were associated with ASL, were positively correlated 518 with Mn. As already discussed above, Tomentella and Alnicola represented more than two-519 thirds of the Alnus community in terms of abundance. Alnus species are known to establish 520 symbiotic relations with these ectomycorrhizal fungi. For instance, (Tedersoo et al., 2009) 521 demonstrated that Tomentella, Alnicola spp. and the Lactarius cyathuliformis groups were 522 among the most frequent taxa in Alnus samples collected from various forests. Alnus is the 523 only member of the Betulaceae family that has evolved root symbiotic relationships with 524

nitrogen-fixing actinobacteria from the genus *Frankia* (Benson & Clawson, 2000; Pujic et al.,
2022) that were recorded in the present study. Nitrogen fixation requires abundant sources of
carbon and phosphorus, and mycorrhizal fungi provide mineral nutrition to plants and are a
supplier of phosphorus for both leguminous and actinorhizal plants (Benson & Clawson,
2000; Tedersoo et al., 2009).

At the Carrières site (Fig. S3b), the first two principal RDA axes represent 24.1 % and 530 8.0 % of the variation of fungal communities. The results showed that the communities are 531 significantly explained by the presence of Zn (adjusted  $R^2 = 0.15$ ). Thus, fungal communities 532 associated with certain tree species of Group 1, such as QPD, QCE, and QPT, were correlated 533 with Cd and Zn. Fungi associated with OCA were correlated with Al and Fe, and fungi 534 associated with SAQ are correlated with Pb. In contrast, the communities associated with 535 Group 2 tree species (PTS, FOR, FOX, HRH, ASA and EUM) were correlated with soil Mg 536 and K contents. A large proportion of these OTUs belongs to Ascomycota-rich group. For 537 example, the OTU 4 corresponding to Hebeloma mesophaeum is a Zn-accumulating 538 ectomycorrhizal (ECM) species (Sácký et al., 2014) and is frequently associated with metal-539 disturbed sites (Foulon et al., 2016; Lacercat-Didier et al., 2016). The association of roots 540with metal-resistant ECM fungi would enhance plant fitness in metal-contaminated 541 environments by improving plant nutrition, reducing the transfer of TEs to the plant and 542 stimulating the response of trees to abiotic stress (de Moura et al., 2022; Dowarah et al., 543 2022). 544

Similarly to Leforest site, no TE significantly explained the fungal communities at Thann site. The first two principal axes of RDA represent 20.3 % and 3.6 % of the variation of fungal communities, respectively (Fig. S3c). The fungal OTUs associated with Group 1 tree species (SAQ, SAL, OCA and QAC) corresponded to ectomycorrhizal fungi and were positively correlated with K and Mg. The same fungal OTUs, composed by various fungal guilds, were shared by the tree species of the Group 2 and were positively correlated with the
S content in the soil.

552

553 *3.5. Microbial communities of OCA, PTS and SAQ change as a function of the study site* 

As described in the Materials and Methods section, OCA, PTS and SAQ were planted 554 at the three sites, which allowed us to assess the impact of site on microbial communities. The 555 results indicated that the three tree species exhibited different bacterial communities, 556 depending on the site (Fig. 6, Fig. S4 and Fig. S5). The Venn diagram indicates that 262 557 OTUs (22.9%) were common at Leforest, Carrieres and Thann for SAQ. For OCA, 291 OTUs 558 (25.8%) were recorded, and 293 OTUs (24.2%) were recorded for PTS. Similarly, the dataset 559 for SAQ (Fig. 6), PTS (Fig. S4) and OCA (Fig. S5) shows that the fungal communities were 560 specific to the site where the trees were grown. Only 6% of the fungal OTUs were shared by 561 all three sites (106 OTUs for SAQ, 115 OTUs for PTS and 144 OTUs for OCA). 562

The ten most abundant bacterial (Table S3) and fungal (Table S4) OTUs of the three common tree species OCA, PTS and SAQ and the unplanted soil (CON) were compared at the three study sites. For OCA, only one fungal OTU identified at the species level (*Tuber maculatum*) was present at the three sites. For SAQ, PTS and control soils, no fungal OTUs were shared among the three sites (Table S4). For bacterial communities, one OTU was recorded for the unplanted soil, PTS and OCA (Sphingomonadaceae for the unplanted soil and *Gemmatimonas* sp. for PTS and OCA), while SAQ did not share any OTUs (Table S3).

570



- 571
- 572
- 573

**Figure 6.** PCoA comparing the bacterial (a) and fungal (b) OTU communities inhabiting the SAQ rhizosphere at the three study sites. The numbers of specific and common OTUs are shown by Venn diagrams.

577

#### 578 **5. Conclusions**

This study aimed to compare the rhizospheric microbiomes of 25 woody species that 579 were planted at an industrial landfill (Thann), an agricultural soil contaminated by wastewater 580 (Carrières) and an agricultural soil contaminated by atmospheric deposition (Leforest) in 581 France. Despite the strong anthropization of the study sites, especially at Thann (industrial 582 landfill-technosoil), microbial colonization of tree roots after four years of phytomanagement 583 occurred, but strong variations were observed between the sites and tree species. The bacterial 584 communities associated with plants differed from those in the unplanted soil, but no 585 difference was observed between the different woody species families. In contrast, the data 586

obtained from the sequencing of fungal DNA showed significant differences between groups 587 of trees, highlighting the selection of fungal communities by some tree species. Indeed, the 588 Betulaceae, Salicaceae and Fagaceae families had the highest proportion of Basidiomycota, 589 especially ECMFs, and the lowest diversity and richness. The other tree families, as well as 590 the unplanted soils, exhibited larger Ascomycota and Mucoromycota communities. Overall, 591 site (and hence soil) and tree species were the main drivers of the microbial communities. The 592 potential for root colonization by microbes was high and led to successful revegetation, 593 improving our phytomanagement strategy. Further studies on the functionality of microbial 594 communities would provide a complete view of these plant-soil-microorganism systems. 595

- 596
- 597

#### 598 Funding:

This work was supported by the French National Research Agency [PHYTOCHEM ANR-13-CDII-0005-01], the French Environment and Energy Management Agency [PROLIPHYT ADEME-1172C0053], the Région Franche-Comté [Environnement-Homme-Territoire 2014-069] and the Pays de Montbéliard Agglomération [13/070-203-2015]. C.Z. received a PhD grant from the French Ministry of Higher Education and Research.

604

#### 605 Acknowledgments

We acknowledge Dr. Nadia Morin-Crini and Caroline Amiot of the PEAT2 platform for ICP analyses. We are also indebted to the Pépinière SOUPE for their precious help in planting and harvesting the trees.

609

610 **Conflicts of Interest:** The authors declare no conflict of interest.

- 611 References
- 612

Adriano, D.C., Wenzel, W.W., Vangronsveld, J., Bolan, N.S., 2004. Role of assisted
natural remediation in environmental cleanup. Geoderma 122, 121–142.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2004.01.003

- Al Souki, K.S., Liné, C., Moravec, J., Douay, F., Pourrut, B., 2022. Response of Three
   Miscanthus × giganteus Cultivars to Toxic Elements Stress: Part 2, Comparison between Two
   Growing Seasons. Plants 11, 945. https://doi.org/10.3390/plants11070945
- Álvarez-López, V., Zappelini, C., Durand, A., Chalot, M., 2020. Pioneer trees of
  Betula pendula at a red gypsum landfill harbour specific structure and composition of rootassociated microbial communities. Sci. Total Environ. 726, 138530.
  https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.138530
- Asensio, V., G. Flórido, F., Ruiz, F., Perlatti, F., Otero, X.L., Ferreira, T.O., 2018.
  Screening of native tropical trees for phytoremediation in copper-polluted soils. Int. J.
  Phytoremediation 20, 1456–1463. https://doi.org/10.1080/15226514.2018.1501341
- Baldrian, P., 2016. Forest microbiome: diversity, complexity and dynamics. FEMS
  Microbiol. Rev. fuw040. https://doi.org/10.1093/femsre/fuw040
- Beauchamp, S., Jerbi, A., Frenette-Dussault, C., Pitre, F.E., Labrecque, M., 2018. Does the origin of cuttings influence yield and phytoextraction potential of willow in a contaminated soil? Ecol. Eng. 111, 125–133. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2017.11.019
- Boyer, F., Mercier, C., Bonin, A., Le Bras, Y., Taberlet, P., Coissac, E., 2016.
  obitools : a unix-inspired software package for DNA metabarcoding. Mol Ecol Resour 16,
  176–182. https://doi.org/10.1111/1755-0998.12428

Buckley, D.H., Schmidt, T.M., 2001. The structure of microbial communities in soil and the lasting impact of cultivation. Microb. Ecol. 42, 11–21. https://doi.org/10.1007/s002480000108

Buée, M., Maurice, J.-P., Zeller, B., Andrianarisoa, S., Ranger, J., Courtecuisse, R., Marçais, B., Le Tacon, F., 2011. Influence of tree species on richness and diversity of epigeous fungal communities in a French temperate forest stand. Fungal Ecol. 4, 22–31. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.funeco.2010.07.003

Ciadamidaro, L., Parelle, J., Tatin-Froux, F., Moyen, C., Durand, A., Zappelini, C.,
Morin-Crini, N., Soupe, D., Blaudez, D., Chalot, M., 2019. Early screening of new
accumulating versus non-accumulating tree species for the phytomanagement of marginal
lands. Ecol. Eng. 130, 147–156. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2019.02.010

Coissac, E., 2012. OligoTag: A Program for Designing Sets of Tags for NextGeneration Sequencing of Multiplexed Samples, in: Pompanon, F., Bonin, A. (Eds.), Data
Production and Analysis in Population Genomics, Methods in Molecular BiologyTM.
Humana Press, Totowa, NJ, pp. 13–31. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-1-61779-870-2\_2

de Gannes, V., Bekele, I., Dipchansingh, D., Wuddivira, M.N., De Cairies, S., Boman,
M., Hickey, W.J., 2016. Microbial Community Structure and Function of Soil Following
Ecosystem Conversion from Native Forests to Teak Plantation Forests. Front. Microbiol. 7.
https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2016.01976

de Moura, M.A., Oki, Y., Arantes-Garcia, L., Cornelissen, T., Nunes, Y.R.F.,
Fernandes, G.W., 2022. Mycorrhiza fungi application as a successful tool for worldwide mine
land restoration: Current state of knowledge and the way forward. Ecol. Eng. 178, 106580.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2022.106580

Dequiedt, S., Thioulouse, J., Jolivet, C., Saby, N.P.A., Lelievre, M., Maron, P.-A.,
Martin, M.P., Prévost-Bouré, N.C., Toutain, B., Arrouays, D., Lemanceau, P., Ranjard, L.,

2009. Biogeographical patterns of soil bacterial communities. Environ. Microbiol. Rep. 1,
251–255. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1758-2229.2009.00040.x

Desjardins, D., Brereton, N.J.B., Marchand, L., Brisson, J., Pitre, F.E., Labrecque, M.,
2018. Complementarity of three distinctive phytoremediation crops for multiple-trace element
contaminated soil. Sci. Total Environ. 610–611, 1428–1438.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.08.196

Di Baccio, D., Tognetti, R., Sebastiani, L., Vitagliano, C., 2003. Responses of Populus
deltoides × Populus nigra (Populus × euramericana) clone I-214 to high zinc concentrations.
New Phytol. 159, 443–452. https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1469-8137.2003.00818.x

Dowarah, B., Gill, S.S., Agarwala, N., 2022. Arbuscular Mycorrhizal Fungi in
Conferring Tolerance to Biotic Stresses in Plants. J. Plant Growth Regul. 41, 1429–1444.
https://doi.org/10.1007/s00344-021-10392-5

Dukunde, A., Schneider, D., Schmidt, M., Veldkamp, E., Daniel, R., 2019. Tree
Species Shape Soil Bacterial Community Structure and Function in Temperate Deciduous
Forests. Front. Microbiol. 10, 1519. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2019.01519

Durand, A., Maillard, F., Alvarez-Lopez, V., Guinchard, S., Bertheau, C., Valot, B., 674 Blaudez, D., Chalot, M., 2018. Bacterial diversity associated with poplar trees grown on a 675 Hg-contaminated site: Community characterization and isolation of Hg-resistant plant 676 growth-promoting bacteria. Sci. Environ. 622-623, 1165–1177. Total 677 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.12.069 678

Durand, A., Maillard, F., Foulon, J., Gweon, H.S., Valot, B., Chalot, M., 2017. Environmental Metabarcoding Reveals Contrasting Belowground and Aboveground Fungal Communities from Poplar at a Hg Phytomanagement Site. Microb. Ecol. 74, 795–809. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00248-017-0984-0

- Fabiańska, I., Gerlach, N., Almario, J., Bucher, M., 2019. Plant-mediated effects of
  soil phosphorus on the root-associated fungal microbiota in Arabidopsis thaliana. New Phytol.
  221, 2123–2137. https://doi.org/10.1111/nph.15538
- Felske, A., de Vos, W.M., Akkermans, A.D.L., 2000. Spatial distribution of 16S
  rRNA levels from uncultured acidobacteria in soil. Lett. Appl. Microbiol. 31, 118–122.
  https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2672.2000.00780.x
- Ficetola, G., Coissac, E., Zundel, S., Riaz, T., Shehzad, W., Bessière, J., Taberlet, P.,
  Pompanon, F., 2010. An *In silico* approach for the evaluation of DNA barcodes. BMC
  Genom. 11, 434. https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2164-11-434
- Fierer, N., Jackson, R.B., 2006a. The diversity and biogeography of soil bacterial
  communities. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 103, 626–631.
  https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0507535103
- Fierer, N., Jackson, R.B., 2006b. The diversity and biogeography of soil bacterial
  communities. Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. U.S.A. 103, 626–631.
  https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0507535103
- Fortin Faubert, M., Labrecque, M., Hijri, M., 2022. Ectomycorrhizal Fungi Dominated
  the Root and Rhizosphere Microbial Communities of Two Willow Cultivars Grown for SixYears in a Mixed-Contaminated Environment. JoF 8, 145. https://doi.org/10.3390/jof8020145
  Foulon, J., Zappelini, C., Durand, A., Valot, B., Blaudez, D., Chalot, M., 2016. Impact
  of poplar-based phytomanagement on soil properties and microbial communities in a metalcontaminated site. FEMS Microbiol. Ecol. 92, fiw163. https://doi.org/10.1093/femsec/fiw163
- Ghosh, S., Das, A.P., 2018. Metagenomic insights into the microbial diversity in manganese-contaminated mine tailings and their role in biogeochemical cycling of manganese. Sci. Rep. 8, 8257. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-018-26311-w

Girardot, F., Allégra, S., Pfendler, S., Conord, C., Rey, C., Gillet, B., Hughes, S., 707 Bouchardon, A.E., Hua, A., Paran, F., Bouchardon, J.L., Faure, O., 2020. Bacterial diversity 708 on an abandoned, industrial wasteland contaminated by polychlorinated biphenyls, dioxins, 709 furans and metals. Sci. Total Environ. 748, 141242. 710 trace https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.141242 711

## 712

Glick, B.R., 2014. Bacteria with ACC deaminase can promote plant growth and help to feed the world. Microbiol. Res. 169, 30-39. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.micres.2013.09.009 713

Gonzalez, E., Pitre, F.E., Pagé, A.P., Marleau, J., Guidi Nissim, W., St-Arnaud, M., 714 Labrecque, M., Joly, S., Yergeau, E., Brereton, N.J.B., 2018. Trees, fungi and bacteria: 715 tripartite metatranscriptomics of a root microbiome responding to soil contamination. 716 Microbiome 6, 53. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40168-018-0432-5 717

Hullot, O., Lamy, I., Tiziani, R., Mimmo, T., Ciadamidaro, L., 2021. The effect of 718 earthworms on plant response in metal contaminated soil focusing on belowground-719 aboveground relationships. Pollut. 274, 116499. Environ. 720 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2021.116499 721

Jia, T., Liang, X., Guo, T., Wu, T., Chai, B., 2022. Bacterial community succession 722 and influencing factors for Imperata cylindrica litter decomposition in a copper tailings area 723 of China. Sci. Total Environ. 815, 152908. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.152908 724

Kidd, P., Mench, M., Álvarez-López, V., Bert, V., Dimitriou, I., Friesl-Hanl, W., 725 Herzig, R., Olga Janssen, J., Kolbas, A., Müller, I., Neu, S., Renella, G., Ruttens, A., 726 Vangronsveld, J., Puschenreiter, M., 2015. Agronomic Practices for Improving Gentle 727 Remediation of Trace Element-Contaminated Soils. Int. J. Phytoremediation 17, 1005–1037. 728 https://doi.org/10.1080/15226514.2014.1003788 729

Kobae, Y., 2019. Dynamic Phosphate Uptake in Arbuscular Mycorrhizal Roots Under 730 Field Conditions. Front. Environ. Sci. 6, 159. https://doi.org/10.3389/fenvs.2018.00159 731

Kowalchuk, G.A., Buma, D.S., de Boer, W., Klinkhamer, P.G.L., van Veen, J.A.,
2002. Effects of above-ground plant species composition and diversity on the diversity of
soil-borne microorganisms. Antonie van Leeuwenhoek. 2002 Kluwer Academic Publishers.
81, 509–520.

Lacercat-Didier, L., Berthelot, C., Foulon, J., Errard, A., Martino, E., Chalot, M.,
Blaudez, D., 2016. New mutualistic fungal endophytes isolated from poplar roots display high
metal tolerance. Mycorrhiza 26, 657–671. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00572-016-0699-y

Lauber, C.L., Hamady, M., Knight, R., Fierer, N., 2009. Pyrosequencing-Based
Assessment of Soil pH as a Predictor of Soil Bacterial Community Structure at the
Continental Scale. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 75, 5111–5120.
https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.00335-09

Laureysens, I., Blust, R., De Temmerman, L., Lemmens, C., Ceulemans, R., 2004.
Clonal variation in heavy metal accumulation and biomass production in a poplar coppice
culture: I. Seasonal variation in leaf, wood and bark concentrations. Environ. Pollut. 131,
485–494. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2004.02.009

Li, H., Smith, S.E., Holloway, R.E., Zhu, Y., Smith, F.A., 2006. Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi contribute to phosphorus uptake by wheat grown in a phosphorus-fixing soil even in the absence of positive growth responses. New Phytol. 172, 536–543. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2006.01846.x

Lindhe, A., Åsenblad, N., Toresson, H.-G., 2004. Cut logs and high stumps of spruce,
birch, aspen and oak – nine years of saproxylic fungi succession. Biol. Conserv. 119, 443–
454. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biocon.2004.01.005

Lopez, S., Morel, J.L., Benizri, E., 2022. The parameters determining hyperaccumulator rhizobacteria diversity depend on the study scale. Sci. Total Environ. 834, 155274. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2022.155274

757	Mench, M., Lepp, N., Bert, V., Schwitzguébel, JP., Gawronski, S.W., Schröder, P.,
758	Vangronsveld, J., 2010. Successes and limitations of phytotechnologies at field scale:
759	outcomes, assessment and outlook from COST Action 859. J. Soils Sediments 10, 1039-
760	1070. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11368-010-0190-x
761	Meyer, L., Guyot, S., Chalot, M., Capelli, N., 2023. The potential of microorganisms
762	as biomonitoring and bioremediation tools for mercury-contaminated soils. Ecotoxicol.
763	Environ. Saf. 262, 115185. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoenv.2023.115185
764	Mleczek, M., Goliński, P., Krzesłowska, M., Gąsecka, M., Magdziak, Z., Rutkowski,
765	P., Budzyńska, S., Waliszewska, B., Kozubik, T., Karolewski, Z., Niedzielski, P., 2017.
766	Phytoextraction of potentially toxic elements by six tree species growing on hazardous mining
767	sludge. Environ. Sci. Pollut. Res. 24, 22183-22195. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-017-
768	9842-3
769	Morris, M.H., Pérez-Pérez, M.A., Smith, M.E., Bledsoe, C.S., 2009. Influence of
770	host species on ectomycorrhizal communities associated with two co-occurring oaks (Quercus
771	spp.) in a tropical cloud forest: Ectomycorrhizal communities in a tropical cloud forest. FEMS
772	Microbiol. Ecol. 69, 274–287. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6941.2009.00704.x
773	Narsing Rao, M.P., Lohmaneeratana, K., Bunyoo, C., Thamchaipenet, A., 2022.
774	Actinobacteria-Plant Interactions in Alleviating Abiotic Stress. Plants 11, 2976.
775	https://doi.org/10.3390/plants11212976
776	Nguyen, N.H., Song, Z., Bates, S.T., Branco, S., Tedersoo, L., Menke, J., Schilling,
777	J.S., Kennedy, P.G., 2016. FUNGuild: An open annotation tool for parsing fungal community
778	datasets by ecological guild. Fungal Ecology 20, 241–248.
779	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.funeco.2015.06.006

780	Oyetibo, G.O., Enahoro, J.A., Ikwubuzo, C.A., Ukwuoma, C.S., 2021. Microbiome of
781	highly polluted coal mine drainage from Onyeama, Nigeria, and its potential for sequestrating
782	toxic heavy metals. Sci. Rep. 11, 17496. https://doi.org/10.1038/s41598-021-96899-z
783	Pfeiffer, B., Fender, AC., Lasota, S., Hertel, D., Jungkunst, H.F., Daniel, R., 2013.
784	Leaf litter is the main driver for changes in bacterial community structures in the rhizosphere
785	of ash and beech. Applied Soil Ecology 72, 150–160.
786	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2013.06.008
787	Phanthavongsa, P., Chalot, M., Papin, A., Lacercat-Didier, L., Roy, S., Blaudez, D.,
788	Bert, V., 2017. Effect of mycorrhizal inoculation on metal accumulation by poplar leaves at
789	phytomanaged sites. Environ. Exp. Bot. 143, 72–81.
790	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envexpbot.2017.08.012
791	Pogrzeba, M., Rusinowski, S., Sitko, K., Krzyżak, J., Skalska, A., Małkowski, E.,
792	Ciszek, D., Werle, S., McCalmont, J.P., Mos, M., Kalaji, H.M., 2017. Relationships between
793	soil parameters and physiological status of Miscanthus x giganteus cultivated on soil
794	contaminated with trace elements under NPK fertilisation vs. microbial inoculation. Environ.
795	Pollut. 225, 163–174. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2017.03.058
796	Pottier, M., García de la Torre, V.S., Victor, C., David, L.C., Chalot, M., Thomine, S.,
797	2015. Genotypic variations in the dynamics of metal concentrations in poplar leaves: A field
798	study with a perspective on phytoremediation. Environ. Pollut. 199, 73-82.
799	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2015.01.010
800	Pujic, P., Alloisio, N., Miotello, G., Armengaud, J., Abrouk, D., Fournier, P.,
801	Normand, P., 2022. The Proteogenome of Symbiotic Frankia alni in Alnus glutinosa Nodules.
802	Microorganisms 10, 651. https://doi.org/10.3390/microorganisms10030651
803	Quintela-Sabarís, C., Marchand, L., Kidd, P.S., Friesl-Hanl, W., Puschenreiter, M.,
804	Kumpiene, J., Müller, I., Neu, S., Janssen, J., Vangronsveld, J., Dimitriou, I., Siebielec, G.,

805	Gałązka, R., Bert, V., Herzig, R., Cundy, A.B., Oustrière, N., Kolbas, A., Galland, W.,
806	Mench, M., 2017. Assessing phytotoxicity of trace element-contaminated soils phytomanaged
807	with gentle remediation options at ten European field trials. Sci. Total Environ. 599-600,
808	1388–1398. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2017.04.187
809	Robinson, B.H., Green, S.R., Chancerel, B., Mills, T.M., Clothier, B.E., 2007. Poplar
810	for the phytomanagement of boron contaminated sites. Environ. Pollut. 150, 225-233.
811	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2007.01.017
812	Rousk, J., Brookes, P.C., Bååth, E., 2009. Contrasting Soil pH Effects on Fungal and
813	Bacterial Growth Suggest Functional Redundancy in Carbon Mineralization. Appl. Environ.
814	Microbiol. 75, 1589–1596. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.02775-08

Sácký, J., Leonhardt, T., Borovička, J., Gryndler, M., Briksí, A., Kotrba, P., 2014.
Intracellular sequestration of zinc, cadmium and silver in Hebeloma mesophaeum and
characterization of its metallothionein genes. Fungal Genet. Biol. 67, 3–14.
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.fgb.2014.03.003

Schwob, G., Roy, M., Manzi, S., Pommier, T., Fernandez, M.P., 2017. Green alder (
Alnus viridis ) encroachment shapes microbial communities in subalpine soils and impacts its
bacterial or fungal symbionts differently. Environ. Microbiol. 19, 3235–3250.
https://doi.org/10.1111/1462-2920.13818

Sebastiani, L., Scebba, F., Tognetti, R., 2004. Heavy metal accumulation and growth 823 responses in poplar clones Eridano (Populus deltoides × maximowiczii) and I-214 (P. × 824 industrial Environ. Exp. 825 euramericana) exposed to waste. Bot. 52. 79-88. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envexpbot.2004.01.003 826

Song, J., Shen, Q., Shi, J., Xu, J., Brookes, P.C., Liu, X., 2021. Changes in microbial
community structure due to chronic trace element concentrations in different sizes of soil
aggregates. Environ. Pollut. 268, 115933. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envpol.2020.115933

Taghavi, S., Garafola, C., Monchy, S., Newman, L., Hoffman, A., Weyens, N., Barac, 830 T., Vangronsveld, J., van der Lelie, D., 2009. Genome Survey and Characterization of 831 Endophytic Bacteria Exhibiting a Beneficial Effect on Growth and Development of Poplar 832 Trees. Appl. Environ. Microbiol. 75, 748–757. https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.02239-08 833 Tanimoto, E., 2005. Regulation of Root Growth by Plant Hormones-Roles for Auxin 834 Gibberellin. and Crit. Rev. Plant Sci. 24. 249-265. 835 https://doi.org/10.1080/07352680500196108 836 Tedersoo, L., Anslan, S., Bahram, M., Põlme, S., Riit, T., Liiv, I., Kõljalg, U., Kisand, 837 V., Nilsson, H., Hildebrand, F., Bork, P., Abarenkov, K., 2015. Shotgun metagenomes and 838 multiple primer pair-barcode combinations of amplicons reveal biases in metabarcoding 839 analyses of fungi. MC 10, 1-43. https://doi.org/10.3897/mycokeys.10.4852 840 Tedersoo, L., Suvi, T., Jairus, T., Ostonen, I., Põlme, S., 2009. Revisiting 841 ectomycorrhizal fungi of the genus Alnus: differential host specificity, diversity and 842 determinants of the fungal community. Phytol. 182, 727-735. New 843 https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2009.02792.x 844 Urbanová, M., Šnajdr, J., Baldrian, P., 2015. Composition of fungal and bacterial 845 communities in forest litter and soil is largely determined by dominant trees. Soil Biol. 846 Biochem. 84, 53-64. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2015.02.011 847 Wei, S., Song, Y., Jia, L., 2021. Influence of the slope aspect on the ectomycorrhizal 848 fungal community of Quercus variabilis Blume in the middle part of the Taihang Mountains, 849 North China. J. For. Res. 32, 385-400. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11676-019-01083-9 850 Zappelini, C., Alvarez-Lopez, V., Capelli, N., Guyeux, C., Chalot, M., 2018. 851 Streptomyces Dominate the Soil Under Betula Trees That Have Naturally Colonized a Red 852 Gypsum Landfill. Front. Microbiol. 9, 1772. https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2018.01772 853

854	Zhang, G., Wang, X., Wu, X., Gao, H., Xiao, S., Zhang, W., Shang, J., Qiao, F., Liu,
855	G., Chen, T., Xie, H., Michalet, R., 2021. Dominant woody plants alter soil microbial
856	community composition during succession. Glob. Ecol. Conserv. 31, e01852.
857	https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gecco.2021.e01852

## **Graphical abstract**



1

